

**Dave Rado**

---

**From:** "Chris Curtis" <Chris.Curtis@lshtm.ac.uk>  
**To:** <dave.rado@dsl.pipex.com>; "Andy Haines" <Andy.Haines@lshtm.ac.uk>  
**Sent:** 15 May 2007 22:59  
**Subject:** Fwd: Reiter's reply

Here is Reiter's reply admitting his mistake.

He had earlier written a paper about malaria in the "Little Ice Age" in the 17th century. This was quite interesting but, even though malaria can occur in cool climates, there would tend to be even more malaria where it is hotter. That is because Plasmodium would be more likely to complete its complex development in the mosquito before the mosquito died. There would also probably be more mosquitoes if climatic change did not include less summer rain and hence fewer mosquito breeding places. However, in fact I do not think it likely that global warming will bring much malaria transmission back to northern Europe because malaria is transmitted from humans to mosquitoes to humans and northern mosquitoes could only become infected from "imported" human cases. However such cases are nearly always promptly treated by the good health services in the north especially because imported malaria cases are not immune to malaria and therefore feel very ill (I know because I have been an imported case!). Despite the existing very hot summers in Italy almost no cases of malaria transmission have returned there since its eradication in the early 1960s. Thus the likelihood of malaria resurgence depends at least as much on the politics of the health service as on temperature.

In the case of pathogens transmitted from reservoirs in wild mammals (e.g. tick borne encephalitis) or birds (West Nile virus) via arthropods to humans the reservoirs are not treated and establishment or increase of the human disease would presumably depend on, among other things, the effect of climate on the biology of the pathogen and the arthropod vector. I have heard that the less severe winters in Sweden are now causing an increase in tick borne encephalitis.

Anyway, regarding your rebuttal of the programme, as indicated above Paul Reiter admitted to me that his claim about malaria in Russia in the 1920s being the worst ever was completely incorrect.

Chris Curtis

**Dave Rado**

---

**From:** "Chris Curtis" <Chris.Curtis@lshtm.ac.uk>  
**To:** "Paul Reiter" <ipreiter@yahoo.fr>  
**Sent:** 09 March 2007 10:51  
**Subject:** RE : malaria in Rusia

Dear Paul

On the TV last night I think I heard you say that the worst malaria ever was in Russia in the 1920s. However in the same era in India the estimate is 75 million cases and 750,000 malaria deaths oer year. Nowadays the estimate for the world (mainly Africa) is 300-500 million clinical cases of malaria per year with malaria causing or contributing to 1-2 million deaths per year.

It is said that the British Indian troops brought *P.falciparum* to Archangel during the summer of 1919 or 1920, but surely the great majority of the malaria cases in Russia (as in other northern climates) were *P.vivax* which nowadays causes almost no deaths. Thus I think one should be sceptical about whether the causes of the large number of malaria deaths which you quoted had been correctly diagnosed under civill war conditions.

Best wishes  
Chris Curtis

15/05/2007

**Dave Rado**

---

**From:** "Paul Reiter" <ipreiter@yahoo.fr>  
**To:** "Chris Curtis" <Chris.Curtis@lshtm.ac.uk>  
**Sent:** 22 March 2007 17:46  
**Subject:** RE : malaria in Rusia

Dear Chris,

Many thanks for your message.

Clearly, I was wrong. I plead ignorance. I only knew about the 1908 epidemic in the Punjab, which Hackett says caused 250,000 deaths.

I should have said "one" of the worst, or perhaps the worst in Europe. And I agree, the stats in that period were surely suspect.

Still, I think the point that malaria is not restricted to the tropics is worth making in this crazy climate change environment. I don't know what you think, but to me the whole world has gone nuts!

If you want to contact me, pls use my Pasteur email, as I rarely look at this address.

All the best to you, and I still owe you a bag.

Paul

--- Chris Curtis <Chris.Curtis@lshtm.ac.uk> a écrit :

> Dear Paul  
> On the TV last night I think I heard you say that  
> the worst malaria  
> ever was in Russia in the 1920s. However in the same  
> era in India the  
> estimate is 75 million cases and 750,000 malaria  
> deaths oer year.  
> Nowadays the estimate for the world (mainly Africa)  
> is 300-500 million  
> clinical cases of malaria per year with malaria  
> causing or contributing  
> to 1-2 million deaths per year.  
> It is said that the British Indian troops brought  
> P.falciparum to  
> Archangel during the summer of 1919 or 1920, but  
> surely the great

- > majority of the malaria cases in Russia (as in other
- > northern climates)
- > were P.vivax which nowadays causes almost no deaths.
- > Thus I think one
- > should be sceptical about whether the causes of the
- > large number of
- > malaria deaths which you quoted had been correctly
- > diagnosed under
- > civill war conditions.
- > Best wishes
- > Chris Curtis
- >

Je ne suis pas à Paris en ce moment. Si vous devez faire contact avec moi instamment, appelez s'il vous plaît mon numéro de téléphone portable. Autrement envoyez s'il vous plaît des emails.

I am not in Paris at the moment. If you need to contact me urgently, please call my mobile phone number. Otherwise please send emails.

\*\*\*\*\*

Paul Reiter, PhD  
Institut Pasteur  
Insectes et Maladies Infectieuses  
25-28 Rue du Dr. Roux  
75724 PARIS Cedex 15  
France

Telephone: 33 (0) 1 44 38 95 62  
Mobile: 33 (0) 6 08 36 16 70  
Secretary: 33 (0) 1 45 68 89 67  
Fax: 33 (0) 1 40 61 30 89

\*\*\*\*\*

---

Découvrez une nouvelle façon d'obtenir des réponses à toutes vos questions !  
Profitez des connaissances, des opinions et des expériences des internautes sur Yahoo!  
Questions/Réponses  
<http://fr.answers.yahoo.com>